

Submission
No 58

**INQUIRY INTO ARTS AND MUSIC EDUCATION AND
TRAINING IN NEW SOUTH WALES**

Organisation: Australian Music Association

Date Received: 25 July 2024

Australian Music Association
PO Box 166, Canterbury NSW 2193



www.australianmusic.asn.au

Ms Julie MP

Chair, Joint Select Committee on Arts and Music Education and Training in New South Wales

25th July 2024

Dear Ms Finn and Committee Members,

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the *Arts and Music Education and Training in New South Wales*.

The Australian Music Association is the industry body representing wholesalers, importers, manufacturers, retailers, and associated businesses for music products in Australia. Established in 1977, the AMA has a strong history of supporting and advocating for the music products industry and contributing to the development of musical life in Australia.

The AMA produces an annual Market Report and quarterly reports analysing imports of music products, contributes to the NAMM Global Report for the music products industry, produces Melbourne Guitar Show, coordinates the Make Music Day campaign in Australia, and works to advance the industry in various ways through advocacy and other projects. We are the leading voice on several particular issues that our industry faces, and we collaborate with national partners to advocate for small business (COSBOA) and music education (Alberts / Music Education Right From The Start), and with international partners to advocate for more music making (NAMM, Make Music Alliance).

We represent the music products industry, which in 2022 imported \$575 million worth of music products (import value¹), an estimated *retail value* including domestic manufacturing of well over \$1 billion. The music products industry includes businesses that develop, make, distribute, sell and repair musical instruments, professional audio equipment, accessories, print music and related products.

The AMA and our members are not typically supported by government funding. We are not focusing on particular funding initiatives that would flow to our organisation or our members, although certain kinds of government investment in the arts may interact with our industry.

Alex Masso

Executive Officer

Australian Music Association

Contents

1. Our approach	2
2. The ‘Long Term Goal’	3
3. Recommendations.....	4
4. Primary & Secondary Education.....	5
5. Vocational Training.....	5
6. Issues in the Terms of Reference.....	7
7. Quality Music Education	10
8. Sport & Music: Understanding the interactions between schools and other providers	11
9. More detail on recommendations	15
Appendix I: Professions and Training	19
Appendix II: Interpreting a model of Quality Music Education.....	21

1. Our approach

We see many benefits of music making and music education, and as an industry we are both passionate about bringing the benefits of music to children’s lives, and deeply connected to the business of music making and its social and economic benefits. The AMA is unbiased when it comes to musical style, pedagogical approach, school system, even product category, but we are committed to our mission: *to be the voice of the music products industry and grow music making in Australia.*

The AMA’s goals include:

- *More to start, fewer to quit:* increasing the number of people that start participating in music making (ideally as children), and having people continue (or recommence) making music through life;
- Universal access to quality classroom music education for all children;
- Increased access to quality instrumental music education (learning to play an instrument, including voice, through private lessons and/or group/ensemble learning);
- Improving resourcing for public schools in particular;
- Finding solutions for the music products industry, including workforce capability.

2. The ‘Long Term Goal’

The terms of reference refer to the *long term goal* of quality music education. The National Review of Music Education (2005) concluded that “Music education in Australian schools is at a critical point where prompt action is needed to right the inequalities in school music.”

It set out the following priorities in summary:

There is a need for immediate priority on improving and sustaining the quality and status of music education.

Action is needed to:

- *Improve the equity of access, participation and engagement in school music for all students;*
- *Improve teacher pre-service and in-service education;*
- *Improve curriculum support services (advisory, instrumental music, vocal music and music technology);*
- *Support productive partnerships and networking with music organisations, musicians, the music industry and the Australian community;*
- *Improve music education in schools through supportive principals and school leadership, adequately educated specialist teachers, increased time in the timetable, adequate facilities and equipment;*
- *Improve levels of accountability; and*
- *Improve the overall status of music in schools.*

The long-term goal articulated in the terms of reference (specifically b. i, ii, iii, iv, vi, vii, ix, and arguably v, vii, x, xi) maps perfectly onto these urgent priorities, set out two decades ago. There has of course been progress in some areas, but we could not assess any point on this list as being achieved in NSW.

A child born when the National Review of School Music Education was released in 2005 would have finished school by now.

The long term goal of quality music education is of course an appropriate goal, and will of course take some time to achieve, but this has not suddenly become apparent and the issues and solutions have not been unknown prior to this inquiry. There is a lot of work to be done and we look forward to seeing that work being done through the work of this Joint Committee, current and future governments, and the music sector.

The NSW Creative Communities policy sets out the “medium term challenge”, “to find ways of providing more opportunities for young people to become proficient performers and informed audiences. This will be addressed by the education review, to increase opportunities for music education in schools and expand creative industry courses offered by TAFE.”ⁱⁱ

Quality music education is a short, medium and long term challenge. We would like to see an action plan developed with immediate steps that can be taken, and aspirations for the medium to long term.

Our primary recommendation is that a Music Education Action Plan be developed, with adequate resourcing (both funding and policy development), to deliver quality music education to all children in NSW.

3. Recommendations

1. **Develop a Music Education Action Plan.** This would be operational in nature, to address systemic barriers to quality music education in NSW, with particular emphasis on public schools. *(TOR: all of part b)*
2. **Set ambitious but achievable standards** as part of providing quality music education to NSW public school students.¹
 - a. 60 minutes of music education for every child, throughout the primary school years *(TOR: part b. i, ii, iii, v, vi, ix)*
 - b. Instrumental music education is core business *(TOR: part b. i, ii, iv, v, vi, vii, viii, ix, x)*
3. **Develop a range of policy initiatives** and responses to advance quality music education in NSW.
 - a. Upgrade the staffing code for music *(TOR: part b. vi, ix)*
 - b. Consider all likely uses of school facilities, including music, as part of Asset Management *(TOR: part b. i, ii, vi; c)*
 - c. Develop tools for Principals *(TOR: part b.vi)*
4. **Provide funding** that will improve opportunities for participation in music education, including:
 - a. Funding for music education programs in public schools *(TOR: part b. i, ii, v, vi, ix)*
 - b. Targeted bursaries / fee relief for participation in music education programs, primarily in public schools *(TOR: part b. i, ii, v, vi in particular, ix, x)*
5. Develop plans to **address workforce capability issues:**
 - a. More specialist music teachers *(TOR: part b. i, ii, iii in particular, vi, ix)*
 - b. Generalist teachers that are more confident teaching music *(TOR: part b. i, ii, iii in particular, vi, ix)*
 - c. Music tutors, conductors and other music educators have access to skills and career development (programs/training/courses) and incentives to use them. *(TOR: part b. i, ii, iv, vi, vii, ix, x)*
 - d. Address skills shortages in the music products industry, particularly Musical Instrument Makers & Repairers *(TOR: part a.i, ii, vii, xi, and part c)*
6. Other proposals
 - a. Collect data, both systematically (reporting, coding) and through surveys or other methods. *(TOR: b. ix in particular; all of part b)*
 - b. Develop initiatives and incentives that encourage ongoing musical learning and participation beyond the school years *(TOR: part b. i, vii, x in particular, and c)*
 - c. Careers information about the music sector *(TOR: part b. x)*

¹ This point focuses on the public school system, we of course support a similar initiative in other school systems but also recognise that in many cases they already do so.

4. Primary & Secondary Education

Terms of reference: *all of part (b)*

For the purpose of this submission, and answering the terms of reference, and all of the relevant issues, it is useful to identify some broad areas of interest to us:

- **Classroom music education.** Conducted in a primary or secondary education setting, taught by a qualified teacher, delivering the relevant curriculum.
- **Instrumental music education.** Conducted formally, at all levels from beginner to elite professional, young children through to adults of any age, in a curricular, co-curricular or extra-curricular environment, without or without structured assessment (eg. AMEB), using any musical instrument (including voice), in an individual or group learning environment.
- **Tertiary music education.** Encompassing some of the previous two categories, particularly instrumental music education, but in a tertiary education environment.
- **Vocational Education & Training,** for other professions in our industry (including retail, but particularly musical instrument making & repair/maintenance).

We will focus on the *first two* areas, and particularly the second. The next section will briefly describe some training & workforce capability issues that we have in the music products industry.

The distinction between classroom & instrumental music education is not necessarily clear, classroom music may take the form of instrumental music program, but for the purpose of identifying issues and solutions we are referring to more typical distinctions in NSW schools where 1) particular kinds of music education are available to student in a classroom environment, during class time, while 2) other forms of music education are available outside that classroom environment.

Some of the issues with classroom music education are addressed in more detail in submissions by Alberts, the Australian Society for Music Education (ASME), and others.

This submission will not restate the case for music education in a general way, guided by the terms of reference and what we consider to be a consensus on this point, we will focus on issues and solutions. Countless studies, reports, and the great work of music educators, including of course many music teachers in NSW, have demonstrated the benefit and value of music making and music education. We refer the Committee to *Music Education: A Sound Investment*ⁱⁱⁱ.

5. Vocational Training

Terms of reference: *a.i) progress towards a long-term goal of quality arts and creative industries education; a.ii) the present level and status of formal arts and creative industries education across all levels, including primary, secondary, and tertiary levels; a.vii) the most effective approach for the arts, culture, and creative industries to co-ordinate with the education system to support the development of creative skills; a.xi) factors influencing student decisions to pursue further arts education, including but not limited to course choice, course location and the method of study; c) any other related matters.*

This submission primarily addresses parts (b) of the terms of reference, given our focus on music and music education. However, we do interact with other professions and skill areas in the creative industries. Our industry interacts with sound and lighting designers in a wide range of performance, creative arts and other applications of music and event technology products. Our industry needs graphic designers, marketing professionals, and other creative industries workers. Many of the professionals in our industry work in roles that involve little or no musical performance, they might be the Sales Manager or General Manager of a musical instrument wholesaler, a Sales Assistant in a

music store, or a manufacturing worker in a guitar factory, but in many cases their background and passion is music making.

Our industry needs particular kinds of technicians that learn and apply skills beyond ‘music’: luthiers, brass and wind instrument technicians and piano tuners & technicians are all music related professions in the creative industries and typically these professionals have a musical (performance) background/training, but there is more to developing those skilled professions than music education. We have shortages of workers in each of these professions.

To illustrate the breadth of our interests, **Appendix 1** shows a range of professions, qualifications, Australian Qualification Framework levels, ANZSCO codes, and relevant Jobs & Skills Councils for some of the professions that our industry employs (excluding general professions such as financial and marketing personnel, warehousing and logistics workers, etc).

These professions vary widely in industry expectations of training, from informal or non-accredited training through to postgraduate qualifications, but there is no single entity with which to develop a workforce plan, even for a specific occupation such as Musical Instrument Maker & Repairer (a single ANZSCO code). We are dealing with some current policy issues and consultations (Draft Core Skills Occupation List, Skills Priority List, Skills Taxonomy, ANZSCO code review).

Our major challenge is with the group of professions that fall under the banner of ‘Musical instrument makers and repairers’. This includes a range of professions including piano tuners & technicians, luthiers (guitar), luthiers (bowed stringed instruments), brass & wind instrument technicians, other instrument technicians, and instrument manufacturing workers (for guitars in particular).

These are quite different specialised professions but from our perspective, there are some similar challenges:

- The workforce is ageing,
- anecdotally we have shortages of these professionals in many areas, there is plenty of work, but
- employers are attempting to bring skilled workers to Australia and ‘hitting a wall’ with the migration system.
- There are no accredited training options in Australia for most of these specialisations,
- if there were training options, we anticipate low enrolment numbers due to the very specific skills areas,
- this reduces the chance of an RTO running a course, therefore
- if there were training options available, they may need to operate outside the accredited system.
- This is a national issue, and we expect there would be sufficient demand to operate one course nationally (eg. for Piano Technology) but some of the structures and funding for VET are state-based, and
- there are two Jobs & Skills Councils, both with staff that are helpful and understanding of our situation, but there is some lack of clarity in how to navigate these issues through the VET system and the skills & training policy infrastructure.

The one program we do have is a Cert IV in instrument making, in Melbourne. This provides a solution to one industry challenge, training workers for the guitar factories in Melbourne, with the additional benefit of training individual luthiers. This is a state-accredited qualification (in Victoria). No such training exists in NSW.

Our industry needs a plan to address workforce capability issues for Musical Instrument Making & Repairing, this requires resourcing and will ultimately need some form of government support through the VET system, JSCs, or otherwise.

Our focus here is on music education in schools, which is a high priority for our association and our industry.

6. Issues in the Terms of Reference

- Quality music education (b. i): see below
- The 'long term goal' of quality music education. (b. i): see above
- The level of formal music education (b. ii)
 - There are good structures in place at every level of formal music education, for some people in some situations. There is good formal music education currently taking place in primary schools, secondary schools, private teaching studios, community ensembles, school co-curricular ensembles, VET, universities, arts organisations, regional conservatoriums, and a range of other settings.
 - There are also gaps in the provision, quality, and access to formal music education, which ought to be the focus of this inquiry.
- The status of formal music education (b. ii)
 - Technically the status of formal music education is entrenched in various places, including:
 - The NSW syllabus & the National Curriculum,
 - the national *Revive* policy and the conceptually related NSW Creative Communities policy, and
 - the NSW Education Act No. 8 (8) (c)^{iv}
 - However, the status of music education is not always as respected as we would like. One example of this issue is the treatment of music programs during 2020 and 2021, particularly the periods of lockdowns and restrictions in schools. When the question was 'is the music program a core part of school operations?', the answer from Principals was not always 'yes'.
- Initial Teacher Education (ITE) (b. iii)
 - *Fading Notes*^v, the recent study of Initial Teacher Education by Alberts goes into great detail providing recent data, comparative data, challenges and solutions for Initial Teacher Education.
 - This has been a perennial issue, outlined in the National Review (2005), Victoria's parliamentary inquiry (2013), and countless times by music education advocates.
 - Music training in ITE degrees has fallen by 53% in 14 years, from an average of 17 hours to just 8 hours in 2022. This includes the 9 years since the National Curriculum was implemented.
 - Therefore music training in Initial Teacher Education has gone backwards during a period that coincides with the implementation of the National Curriculum: The Arts. That initiative (the National Curriculum: The Arts) is the major contribution of federal cultural policy to music education, and it does not appear to have helped with one of the fundamental challenges.
 - We need more consistent data collection to identify what is improving or declining. How many generalist primary school teachers are confident teaching music? What is happening in the specialist music teacher workforce specifically? How many students have access to a continuous, sequential, ongoing education in music? Where are the gaps? How many students play a musical instrument? These basic questions cannot be answered with any confidence.

- Role of regional conservatoriums (b. iv): see below
- Role of creative professionals (b. iv)
 - There is a mutually beneficial, but informal, system involving professional musicians and music education.
 - It is typical for a trained professional musician to spend part of their working time as a private tutor, or in some other form of educational activity (conductor, program leader). The students have direct access to a working professional musician, and the professional musician has access to somewhat steady work and interaction with students to pass on their skills and knowledge.
 - There is little (arguably no) structure to measure, acknowledge, celebrate or improve this system, which occurs every day in schools and community settings but is often unnoticed.
- Efficacy of primary and secondary curriculum (b. v)
 - We are not curriculum experts and will not comment on the content of the NSW music syllabus specifically.
 - However, we could not say that there is efficacy in the structure of the curriculum because it does not produce the desired outcome of a quality education in music for all students.
 - One of the unusual features of music in the NSW curriculum framework is that music is mandatory for 100 hours in Stage 4, with the structure and workforce planning to have this delivered by suitably skilled and qualified classroom teachers, but no such requirement (for hours, or quality of teaching) occurs in stages 1, 2, or 3. So a child could go through primary school with little or no experience in music, then arrive in year 7 (stage 4) and take it as a mandatory subject. This is not ideal and that time in Stage 4 would be more productive if all children had a quality education in music during the primary school years.
 - One of the core proposals of our submission is that the primary curriculum in particular needs to have a corresponding minimum time requirement, as does the secondary curriculum. We suggest 60 minutes per week.
- Support for teachers (b. vi)
 - The problems of overwork and workforce shortages are well known and we cannot use space in this submission explaining them. Suffice to say, there are special requirements for music teachers that need to be taken into account.
 - There should be multiple forms of support for teachers, including
 - An assessment of professional development opportunities from all providers (arts organisations, conferences, professional associations, unions, Department of Education, other providers) followed by a strategy to fill gaps in professional development opportunities;
 - Acknowledgement of the additional (often substantial) workload that comes with musical activities, including where specialist music teachers work after-hours delivering co-curricular (eg. instrumental music, musical theatre) programs;
 - Resourcing for schools, to support the work of teachers;
 - The teaching code for Music (MUS) for primary schools should be upgraded to the same status as STEM or Language teacher codes.
- Support for principals (b. vi)
 - Principals should not be expected to know enough about music to structure and deliver quality music programs in their schools.
 - They should, however, have access to advice and resources to deliver quality music programs in their schools.

- We are proposing that Principals be given the tools to use music as a vehicle for school improvement.
- Inclusive approach towards resource allocation (b. vi)
 - The allocation of resources is highly inequitable across the school systems. One retailer that deals extensively with school accounts reported that in a typical year, 20% of sales will be to public schools, 20% to Catholic systemic schools, and 60% to independent schools. This is in contrast with 63% of NSW students attending public schools, 21% attending Catholic schools, and 16% attending independent schools.^{vi}
 - To address the under-resourcing of public schools, we are proposing grant funding specifically for arts programs in those schools.
- Coordination of music and creative industries with the education system (vii)
 - Our industry interacts with the education system in various ways, including through providing music education programs (eg. in music stores), supporting and providing teacher training opportunities (eg. at conferences), advocating for music education, campaigning for the benefits of music making (including our *Make Music Day* campaign^{vii}), and more.
 - In Part 8 we have outlined some of the ways that arts organisations, music stores and other private providers, regional conservatoriums and community groups support music education in schools by fulfilling crucial functions akin to community sporting clubs.
 - Part 5 (Vocational Education & Training) addresses some issues in our industry, particularly *musical instrument makers & repairers*.
- Measures of success in music education (b. ix)
 - We have proposed 1) developing ways of measuring music education activity in NSW, 2) developing ways of defining or measuring quality music education, and ultimately trying to measure success at a micro (school or program) and macro (state or school system) level.
- Student decisions to pursue further music education (b. x)
 - The second part of the statement we began with (‘more to start, **fewer to quit**’) expresses a desire to maintain music making after the schooling years, whether people pursue further education or career opportunities or not.
 - This point in the terms of reference appears to be narrower than this aspiration, considering the pursuit of higher education in music. This is important in providing opportunities, and providing training to practice music at a high level and work in the industry, but is not our primary goal.
 - We want students to *continue making music* (fewer to quit), which could take any number of forms including playing without further training, informal education/training, formal (VET or University) study, taking a completely different musical path, playing for personal enjoyment, participating in community music activities, or taking a break and returning to music making later in life.
 - We are suggesting ways of supporting students through crucial transition points, particularly primary to secondary and **secondary to post-secondary/adulthood**.
- Other jurisdictions (b. xi)
 - A lot can be learned from other jurisdictions. We cannot elaborate in great detail but will summarise some jurisdictions and propose some actions.
 - The gold standard for inter-jurisdictional policy development in the music sector is the Live Music Office. This initiative, set up as part of the Creative Australia policy in 2013, has worked with local, state and federal governments across Australia for over a decade to spread best practice policy development. Its *Live and Local* initiative, a program involving local government and industry connections,

complements this policy work and builds capacity for live music in local communities.

- There is no perfect equivalent to the Live Music Office for music or arts education, the closest parallel is the Alberts initiative *Music Education: Right From The Start*, which is policy and research focused. This has been a positive development for music education in Australia and the AMA is proud to be involved, though its Advisory Group.
- All states and territories have something to learn from the others when it comes to best practice music education. Queensland has a relatively comprehensive program of music education for public primary school students, Western Australia has a centralised but opt-in instrumental music program model, New South Wales has very good elite instrumental music programs within The Arts Unit and a network of regional conservatoriums, South Australia has a 10 year strategy to develop quality music education.
- We would see value in a cross-jurisdictional initiative to share policy development, at the level of detail we will get into with our and other submissions to this Committee.
- Community links (b. x; c)
 - One of the challenges faced by community music groups is recruiting young people to continue in ensembles after leaving the primary and secondary schooling years.
 - This is a concern for us, wanting *more to start, fewer to quit*; leaving school is the point where many people do in fact ‘quit’.
 - This submission describes many kinds of education programs that complement what happens inside schools, in a similar way to sporting clubs complementing school sport. One of the functions of these programs and activities is to bridge the crucial transition points (primary to secondary, secondary to post-secondary).
 - The range of educational environments available in NSW play an important role, including music stores and private music schools, regional conservatoriums, arts organisations (Sydney Youth Orchestras, SIMA’s Young Women’s Jazz Workshops, Australian Taiko Academy and so on) and community groups. We support strong and resilient organisations of all kinds, including in the private sector, and interactions with schools and school students.

7. Quality Music Education

Terms of reference: *b.i) progress towards a long-term goal of quality music education, including actions to address identified barriers; all of part b*

This submission encourages the Joint Standing Committee to give serious consideration to instrumental music education as part of the inquiry, by raising issues and proposing solutions. Underlying this desire to support music education in all its forms, including curricular and co-curricular music education, classroom music and instrumental music education, is the goal of *quality music education*.

We are using ‘Quality’ as shorthand for the following components:

- continuous, sequential, developmental music education programs,
- using the framework outlined in *Music Education: A Sound Investment*,
- a model for quality provision of music education that could be used at a micro level (individual school or program, the experience of individual students) and a macro level (all of NSW; NSW public school system).

There are many paths to achieving a quality education in music. You might achieve it as an individual through a rigorous application of formal study in Hindustani music through a guru-shishya (‘mentor-protégé’) model, miles away from the kind of concerns we are focusing on here. You might achieve it through a purely orchestral music program, you might achieve it through a rich classroom music experience without a large ensemble program at all. You might achieve it through the kind of comprehensive initiative (*Amadeus*) underway in Sydney Catholic Schools, and you could certainly achieve it in the NSW public school system with sufficient commitment and resources.

In NSW the major institutional components that provide music education are the school systems (public, Catholic, independent), the private sector (which we partially represent), and Tertiary institutions (Universities, TAFE and independent VET providers), as well as regional conservatoriums, not for profit arts organisations, P & C’s, and others. We need to narrow the focus here to schooling, public schooling in particular, and the interaction between schools and other providers.

The overall goal should be quality music education, the strategy should be to bring all possible providers of music education up to what could be described as quality music education, and all actions should service that goal and strategy. **Appendix II** analyses the model of quality music education articulated in *Music Education: A Sound Investment*, to demonstrate that

- This model can be applied to particular schools, institutions and local contexts (micro level) and to NSW as a whole (macro level).
- There is already plenty to work with in any element of this model of quality music education.
- This model includes considerations for classroom and instrumental music education.
- There are questions to be asked for each element, which can lead to goals, actions, and measurement of success.

8. Sport & Music: Understanding the interactions between schools and other providers

Terms of reference: (b. i) progress towards a long-term goal of quality music education, including actions to address identified barriers; (b. iv) the role of regional conservatoriums and creative professionals in music education; (b. vii) the most effective approach for the music and the creative industries to co-ordinate with the education system to support the development of creative skills.

Scenario 1: A student in a NSW public school may take an interest in soccer through school sport and try out to join the PSSA^{viii} soccer team, which provides weekly training and games for two terms each year. If that student is keen to develop their skills and play more soccer, they would likely join a local club. There is a representative structure for soccer in the school system, through Zone, Regional and State teams but those students would probably develop their skills beyond what is possible in the PSSA team, through participation in a local club.²

Scenario 2: A student in a public school may take an interest in playing the drums, through school music class and/or joining the school band, which provides weekly rehearsals and performance opportunities throughout the year. If that student is keen to develop their skills and play more drums, they might pursue: a regional (concert or brass) band or orchestra, a program run by an arts organisation, opportunities at a Regional Conservatorium, or a program at their local music store. There are representative opportunities for music in the school system, through The Arts Unit, but those students would have likely developed their skills beyond what is possible a school program

² This scenario is based on personal experience

through participation in activities and tuition outside school, or perhaps in an in-school, co-curricular program³.

The function of the local sporting club includes

- Skill development,
- providing a social environment for students with particular interests,
- providing pathways for students that wish to pursue them,
- opportunities for participation beyond what a school can provide (additional time),
- filling a gap that a school cannot provide (for example, a sport that fewer students are involved in),
- complementing and feed into pathways in the school system, and
- providing consistency for students across key transition points (primary to secondary, secondary to post-secondary).

The chance of a student in a NSW public school having an opportunity to *have a go* at a sport, or probably a range of sports, is relatively high because sport is typically embedded into curricular and co-curricular programs *during the school day*. This is the case even though there are far too many sports to cover adequately, and different schools may excel in different sports based on the expertise of teachers or other reasons. You cannot do everything but you can do something, for all students. We cannot say that the chances of students getting the opportunity to *have a go* at music is equally high.

The function of the PSSA team in any given school is an extension (and selective) activity for interested students, with a fee for participation⁴, but led by school staff and conducted mostly during the school day. PSSA would typically take a student out of class for a longer period than a music activity.

The equivalent for music programs can take many different forms. A band, choir, string/orchestra or other instrumental music program in a school could be run by:

- a school teacher
 - sub-categories: voluntarily, or as part of their job as a specialist music teacher;
- a regional conservatorium;
- a private provider, fulfilling a very similar role to a regional conservatorium for a Sydney school;
 - sub-categories: a company running a substantial program across multiple schools; an individual contractor engaged to run one particular activity in a school.
- a not-for-profit arts organisation;
- the P & C;
- an instrumental music program organised within the school, employing a conductor as a school employee;
 - a sub-category of this: a cross-campus / inter-school instrumental music program (this happens in some secondary colleges with multiple campuses, for example).

The wide range of models that are used to run instrumental music programs, which is analogous to PSSA sport, does make it difficult to set standards, measure activity, improve access to these

³ This scenario is based on personal experience

⁴ The fees for different programs could be studied and this comparison would be interesting, but we do not have sufficient data to comment on this. As an indicative example, in one school the PSSA team (run by school teachers) costs \$155 for 2 terms (one season) while the band program run by a private provider costs \$440 for the same period of time.

programs, create pathways, form connections between schools (although some, such as the private providers in Sydney and regional conservatoriums, do this themselves) and share knowledge.

There is no feasible way to bring consistency in operational models, without significant disruption and investment. What could be done is a form of support within the Department of Education for developing and sustaining music programs, incentives (such as the funding we are proposing) which could be associated with data collection and setting 'quality standards' (specific points from the 'quality music education' model we discussed above, and an initiative to set or improve standards such as tutor and conductor professional development.

Although there are units within the Department of Education for sport and the arts, the similarities and analogies do not extend all the way through the system. There is no equivalent to PSSA for music (we do not suggest creating an equivalent structure).

Sporting clubs receive funding and resources, both from higher structures, grants and sponsorship, which community bands often cannot access. Sporting clubs may have the capacity to start at lower levels and with a low barrier to participation (for example, all equipment is provided), whereas community music groups typically don't have access to resources. The principal role of community sport is not the development of elite athletes, even though this is one of the outputs, just as careers and elite pathways are not the principal role of community music ensembles, programs run by arts organisations, music stores or regional conservatoriums.

There is typically no coordination for pathways (or, for example, pedagogy) within an entire form of music in the absence of a strong governing body. There are associations for community bands and choirs, but they do not function in the same way or have the resources of Football NSW or Little Athletics, the analogy does not extend all the way through the structure of these programs.

For the purpose of this inquiry, it is worth noting that the NSW public school system treats pathways in particular sporting activities as a function of the school system, with infrastructure at every level (school, zone, regional, state, national) to facilitate pathways across a range of sports. It does not, however, treat 'learning an instrument' or particular approaches to playing music in the same way, with infrastructure at every level to support the development of musical activity and student participation. Those opportunities do exist but are not so embedded in the system, not formally recognised in the same way, and the opportunities to students are not as consistent.

The reality is that in the absence of a state-wide system (like Queensland) there is a wide range of co-curricular music programs and providers of those programs. We do not anticipate a major change in this mixed model of provision, but there are opportunities to improve it.

In response to (b. iv) in the terms of reference, we can look at the role of regional conservatoriums and creative professionals as being analogous to the more structured sporting clubs and sporting infrastructure within the public school system, not for the purpose of suggesting that music uses the sporting club model, but to understand the function of these other programs and institutions and how they interact with the school system.

One way to improve music education would be to consider the range of programs and institutions that play a role akin to regional conservatoriums or sporting clubs, and consider:

- The opportunities and gaps (data collection),
- filling gaps in provision (funding, and potentially new initiatives),
- reducing barriers to participation (bursaries, program funding), and
- creating incentives to achieve quality music education, including initiatives and incentives that would increase the skills of tutors and other music educators.

The following table includes each of the functions of sporting clubs, described above, and a consideration of whether and how providers outside the school system can provide these.

	Community choir, orchestra or band, including Youth choir/orchestra/band	Regional conservatorium (ensembles & other programs)	Specialised program run by an arts organisation ⁵	Inter-school music program ⁶	Private providers, including music schools within music stores ⁷
Skill development	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Social environment for students with particular interests	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Provides pathways in particular areas of musical activity	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Fill a gap in opportunities that schools may not be able to provide	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Provide consistency across key transition points	Yes	Yes	Potentially	Potentially	Yes
Complement and feed into pathways within the school system	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Recommend that bursaries may be used:	Yes	(already part of funding)	Yes	Yes	Yes
Recommend direct funding:				Yes	

The proposals related to this section, co-curricular programs within school, outside school, and the function of other music education providers in relation to schools, are the subject of several proposals in this submission. In particular, program funding for school music programs and a bursary / fee relief initiative for fee-based music programs.

⁵ * Sydney Childrens Choir, Taikoz / Australian Taiko Academy, SIMA's Young Womens Jazz Workshops, Sydney Youth Orchestra

⁶ ** Including programs coordinated by school staff or Regional Arts Coordinators (Sinfonia Jubilate, Illawarra South East Regional Performing Ensemble, Sydney North Public Schools Band Program, Sydney Southeast Symphonic Winds), independent programs with close links to a certain cohort of school students (Inner West Jazz Orchestra)

⁷ ***eg. Stormer Music, Big Music School, Jazz Workshop Australia

9. More detail on recommendations

Error! Reference source not found. **60 minutes of music education per week for every child** (TOR: part b. i, ii, iii, v, vi, ix)

- The primary and unavoidable goal ought to be that every child has the opportunity to participate in music education as part of their regular schooling, through stages 1-4.
- We support the consensus in several other submissions^{ix} that 60 minutes per week during the school year is appropriate.
- *Every child, every week*^x
- This cannot be done easily, but would be a target to reach through several years of effort, in particular through focusing on workforce capability and resourcing.

2.b Instrumental music education is core business (TOR: part b. i, ii, iv, v, vi, vii, viii, ix, x)

Develop policy settings that support and enable quality instrumental music in NSW public schools, including:

- Recognition at Department level of the **importance and value of instrumental music** programs, which are:
 - A curriculum-based activity,
 - A core part of school operations,
 - Part of the educational and cultural life of a school,
 - An element of quality music education that complements classroom music education,
 - Providing quality and rich educational experiences for students.
- Specifically including the **quality and resilience of school instrumental music programs** to the objectives of The Arts Unit, Regional Arts Development Officers and regional conservatoriums. Remove any doubt that they may allocate resources and measure their success (if they choose to do so) according to this objective.
- Developing **resources for school principals**, including policies, templates and information about developing school music programs, templates for permission & excursions, managing assets and procurement, enabling equitable participation, and developing quality music education programs.
- Provide **grants and bursaries** (see above)
- Create a status for **instrumental music or co-curricular music liaison** within a school team. An optional position, with a reasonable allowance for time to coordinate activities and liaise with school staff and other stakeholders, and (crucially) with a preference for consistency over time.
- Develop structures and incentives for **professional development** in the instrumental music workforce, already active in NSW public schools and Regional Conservatoriums. For example, recognition programs, paid professional development at least annually.

3.a Upgrade the Staffing Code for Music (TOR: part b. vi, ix)

- The Staffing Code for Music (MUC) sits alongside band (BAN), choir (CIR) and such skills as Information & Technology (ICT) or sport (SPO).^{xi}
- This is a **Skills and experience code**, and *Skills and/or experience codes are not utilised for Central Appointment matching methods (Step 1 or Step 2 of the staffing procedure for filling classroom teacher vacancies on a permanent basis)*.
- Our understanding is that this makes permanent appointment of specialist music teachers in primary schools more difficult.

- We propose that this code become a **Subject / teaching area code**, alongside Primary Mathematics (PRM) and languages (eg. French, PFR).

3.b Ensure that asset management policies consider music and other reasonably anticipated uses of school facilities (TOR: part b. i, ii, vi; c)

- The NSW Department of Education Asset Management Policy provides *Direction and guidance for staff managing school assets. Supports planning, management and decision-making for school assets.*^{xii}
- *There is scope in the Asset Management Framework to consider ‘School & Community Users Needs’ and ‘Educational Requirements’.*^{xiii}
- However, school halls are sometimes built and facilities are sometimes upgraded without considering the likely uses of the facility including music, for example taking into account:
 - Acoustics,
 - stage size & layout,
 - sufficient storage (and, for example, sporting and musical equipment having suitable and separate spaces),
 - sufficient space for whole school attendance, and
 - breakout spaces.

3.c Develop tools for Principals to use music as a vehicle for school improvement, including through School Improvement Plans (SIPs): (TOR: part b.vi)

- Approaches that lead to positive outcomes across relevant areas and requirements;
- Ways of measuring success;
- Guides, templates, advice of experienced leaders (for example, from within The Arts Unit, other Principals);
- Resources for delivering whole-of-school improvements through music.

4.a Funding for music education programs in NSW (TOR: part b. i, ii, v, vi, ix)

The allocation of resources is highly inequitable across the school systems. One retailer that deals extensively with school accounts reported that in a typical year, 20% of sales will be to public schools, 20% to Catholic systemic schools, and 60% to independent schools. This is in contrast with 63% of NSW students attending public schools, 21% attending Catholic schools, and 16% attending independent schools.^{xiv}

In 2021 the Minister for Education announced one round of grants for arts programs, up to \$10,000 per grant, using the budget allocation not spent as a result of cancelling that year’s *Schools Spectacular*.^{xv} This is a direct and recent precedent for what we are proposing.

- According to the Minister, *235 schools applied for a Minister’s Arts Recovery Grant. Grants covered all art forms. Over half of the applications were for music programs.*^{xvi}
- This is just over 10% of NSW public schools, with an estimated success rate of 20-35% (the list of recipients was not found, but the pool of funding would have allocated \$10,000 to 70 schools, we know that some schools received less than \$10,000 so there may have been 80 schools or so).
- Yamaha offers a grant program for this purpose, the Great Start Grant, which this year expanded to 10 grants and including existing programs (in previous years, the grant was to establish a program). Demand vastly exceeds the available pool of funding.
- The NSW government could help meet this demand.

- Therefore, applying this model as an annual or biannual funding program with a higher pool of funding would likely attract applicants from worthwhile programs.
- Funding could be targeted to school-based programs, including those facilitated for a school by a regional conservatorium or other provider. There is also a cohort of ongoing inter-school music programs, and inter-school activities/projects that bridge the primary-secondary gap, which would be worthy of support.

4.b Fund equitable access. (TOR: part b. i, ii, v, vi in particular, ix, x)

Develop a bursary program for fee-based music programs/activities. We propose that this would be:

- Specifically for active arts education programs, which may include the user-pays expenses of representative programs (regional or state dance, music, etc), music camps, band or orchestra programs, tuition.
- Managed by Principals, based on set criteria but trusting Principals to assess the needs of their students.
- Allowing bursaries to contribute towards programs within school, or as part of extension or representative school activities, including co-curricular and after school activities within the school, including those run by P & C's, arts organisations, external providers, and regional conservatoriums.
- Taking the place of Creative Kids, with significantly more targeting and perhaps a similar amount of investment.

5.c Skills and career development for instrumental music tutors, conductors and other professionals (TOR: part b. i, ii, iv, vi, vii, ix, x)

- A training and/or mentoring initiative for *conductors*;
- Training and/or mentoring initiative for *program direction* (overseeing/managing a program of more than one ensemble, including recruitment, progression through ensembles, community and primary/secondary links, performances, musical development, financial and asset management);
- Training and/or mentoring initiative for *tutors*;
- Providing career pathways for these professionals, specifically addressing early career / trainee professionals, and highly skilled & experienced professionals;
- Creating incentives for using the kind of 'points based' system of accredited professional development already in place for classroom teachers. This could not be mandated easily, with the wide range of employment arrangements for tutors and conductors, but fee relief, career or job opportunities, and professional recognition could provide a carrot where there is no stick.

6b Develop initiatives and incentives that encourage ongoing musical learning and participation beyond the school years (TOR: part b. i, vii, x in particular, and c)

For example:

- Youth music programs of all kinds, particularly those that take students through crucial transition points (primary to secondary, secondary to post-secondary/adulthood).
- Community music interaction with schools, and support for community music groups that involve young people at the secondary/post-secondary transition point.
- Programs within schools that develop initiative and sustainable music practice.

6c Careers information for the music sector (TOR: part b. x)

- Provide resources and information to students at late secondary (and potentially tertiary) level about the range of career opportunities in music.
- Note: we provide such information for our industry: australianmusic.asn.au/careers/
- This is a widely understood challenge where industry effort is still required. We have skills shortages and do need to provide young people interested in musical careers about the range of career options.

Appendix I: Professions and Training

Profession	AQF Level	Example of qualifications	Training Package	Jobs & Skills Council	Accredited tertiary training offered in Australia	Industry standard / expectations	ANZSCO CODE
Musician, composer	2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8	Certificate II, III, IV, Diploma, Advanced Diploma in Music, BMus, Masters/ Postgrad	CUA – Creative Arts & Culture	Service & Creative Skills Australia (SaCSA) (Strategic Workforce Advisory Group: Arts)	Yes (VET, University)	Combination of Informal, formal, Tertiary education (AQF level 6, 7, 8)	211211, 211212, 211213, 211214, 211299
Music educator (Classroom teacher)	7, 8, 9, 10	Bachelor of Music Education, Masters / postgrad				AQF level 7, 8	241411, 241213
Music educator (Private tutor)	6, 7,8	Bachelor of Music			Yes/No*	Could be AQF level 4-5 Currently embedded in AQF level 7-8, or not addressed	249214
Live Production, audio engineering, event technology	3, 4, 5, 6	Certificate III, IV, Diploma, Advanced Diploma in Live Production & Technical Services	CUA – Creative Arts & Culture	Service & Creative Skills Australia (Strategic Workforce Advisory Group: Arts)	Yes (VET)	Combination of informal / formal training.	399516, 399599
Musical instrument manufacturing worker; Luthier	3, 4	Certificate III & IV in Musical Instrument Making & Maintenance	22563VIC	N/A (Theoretically, this falls under Skills Insight but is a state-accredited qualification)	Yes (VET)	Combination of informal / formal training.	399515, 133411
Brass & wind instrument technician	(would be 3-4)	N/A	N/A	N/A (ditto)	No	Combination of informal / formal training.	399515
Piano tuner / technician	4	Certificate IV in Piano Technology	MSF – Furnishing Training Package	Skills Insight	No	Combination of informal / formal training,	399515

						verification of skills.	
Music retail & wholesale professionals	3, 4	Certificates in Retail, Retail Management	SIR – Retail Services Training Package	Service & Creative Skills Australia (Strategic Workforce Advisory Group: Retail)	Yes (VET)	Skills & experience.	621511, 621111, 611399, 133311, 133312

**The status of training for the profession of ‘Music Teacher (Private Tuition)’ is not well established. What tends to happen is that people will train in Music Performance and go on to work as a Private Tutor, or train in Music Education and choose to work as a Private Tutor instead of (or in addition to) classroom teaching, or in some cases (less common with younger generations of professionals) people are not trained at all but work as a Private Tutor.*

Appendix II: Interpreting a model of Quality Music Education

Component	Summary	Interpretation: Micro level	Interpretation: Macro level	Challenges	Are we there yet?
Start early	Start ideally in pre-school	Is music education provided for the youngest students (eg. Stage 1) and ongoing?	Is music education provided to all pre-school and Stage 1 students?	Preparation/ skills/training of teachers; Hours of music education taught	No
Recognise that all children are musical	Music education is beneficial for all students and should be accessible to them.	Free provision of music education, ie. Classroom or otherwise freely available program.	Does every student <i>really</i> have access to music education?	No data to support an assertion that all children in NSW have access to music education; Evidence suggests that they do not	No
Commit to quality music education	Quality programs, teachers and pedagogy.	Logical, well structured programs. This does not prescribe a type of program.	At least every school, and ideally every co-curricular program, is a well-structured program with suitable teachers.	Develop measures of success; Collect data	No
Learn a complex musical instrument	Instruments such as complex strings, wind, brass and percussion take years to master and require consistent effort, but it is this effort that will result in positive cognitive development	Minimum: Provide the opportunity to learn a complex instrument Ideally: <i>Every student</i> has an opportunity to learn a musical instrument (eg. Amadeus program, Qld public schools)	Do all children have the opportunity to learn a complex instrument? Has a serious effort been made to address affordability for families that cannot afford market rates?	Additional resourcing for schools (eg. Purchasing instruments); availability of skilled instrumental tutors including ongoing PD; bursaries available; how many children learn a musical instrument?	No
Learn music (classroom and/or instrument) over a long	Ongoing, active, structured and sequential; one-off activities may	Is there a sequential program available for students to progress, which	Do we know that music is taught effectively across at least three stages of	Difficult to sustain sequential programs with small numbers (eg. smaller	No

period of time (3-7 years)	complement but do not achieve this goal	may be a combination of classroom and co-curricular music education?	schooling (ideally, the first four); Are there connections between music education in primary and secondary school?	schools); the connection between music programs in primary & secondary school is not always made.	
Maintain a high level of engagement	Age appropriate level of 30 minutes to 7 hours per week during the academic year.	Is classroom music education available for all children, every week? Are co-curricular music opportunities available to complement this?	Is the primary school workforce confident & skilled in teaching music? Do schools provide opportunities with a high level of engagement?	Gaps in the skills of primary school teachers; Gaps in the availability and resourcing of specialist music teacher roles; Gaps in the provision of co-curricular and rich school-based music opportunities.	No
Support high levels of teacher expertise	Formal qualification and professional development is imperative.	Do classroom qualified teachers have adequate training & skills to confidently teach music? Do other music educators have suitable skills & training?	Are there incentives & opportunities for all teachers (classroom & peripatetic / instrumental music) to increase their skills & knowledge?	Opportunities for primary school generalists but a huge task to upskill the workforce; insufficient music training in ITE; insufficient opportunities and incentives for professional development of music tutors.	No
Utilise teaching pedagogy that is active, formal and structured	Including activities related to pitch, rhythm, singing, instrumental work, composition and improvisation, and reading notation.	Is music teaching covering, and going beyond, the relatively basic level set out in the NSW music syllabus?	Is the syllabus fit for purpose?	We defer to curriculum experts on this point.	No

References

- i Australian Music Association, Market Report 2023: Table 2a
<https://www.datawrapper.de/ /027Cz/?v=4>
- ii NSW Government (2023) Creative Communities: Culture and Creative Industries Policy
<https://www.nsw.gov.au/sites/default/files/2023-12/creative-communities-arts-culture-and-creative-industries-policy.pdf>
- iii Collins, A., Dwyer, R., Date, A. (2020) Music Education: A Sound Investment (Full Report)
https://www.alberts.co/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Alberts_Music-Education-Report_A4.pdf
- iv NSW Education Act (1990) No 8 <https://legislation.nsw.gov.au/view/whole/html/inforce/current/act-1990-008>
- v Hocking, R. (2023) *Fading Notes: The State of Music Education for the Next Generation of Primary Teachers* https://www.alberts.co/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/Music-Education-ITE-Report_A4_130623.pdf
- vi Australian Bureau of Statistics (2023) *Schools: Table 90a Key Information, by States and Territories, 2022 to 2023*
<https://www.abs.gov.au/statistics/people/education/schools/latest-release>
- vii Make Music Australia: www.makemusicaustralia.org.au
- viii Primary School Sports Association <https://app.education.nsw.gov.au/sport/nswpssa>
- ix Alberts, ASME
- x This phrase is borrowed from the QTU campaign to *maintain* the existing level of music education in Queensland public schools, as a way of highlighting the work that needs to be done to match what is already available in another jurisdiction <https://www.qtu.asn.au/music-every-child>
- xi NSW Department of Education (2024), *Staffing Codes – Primary* <https://education.nsw.gov.au/about-us/careers-at-education/roles-and-locations/roles-at-education/teaching/staffing-procedure-appendices/staffing-codes/staffing-codes-primary>
- xii NSW Department of Education (2024). *Asset Management Policy, V02.0.0.*
<https://education.nsw.gov.au/policy-library/policies/pd-2021-0477>
- xiii NSW Department of Education (2024). *Asset Management Framework.*
<https://www.schoolinfrastructure.nsw.gov.au/what-we-do/we-look-after-our-schools/document-1.html>
- xiv Australian Bureau of Statistics (2023) *Schools: Table 90a Key Information, by States and Territories, 2022 to 2023*
<https://www.abs.gov.au/statistics/people/education/schools/latest-release>
- xv NSW Department of Education (19 September 2021). *Arts programs receive spectacular boost.*
<https://education.nsw.gov.au/news/latest-news/arts-programs-receive-spectacular-boost>
- xvi Houssos, Courtney to the Minister for Education and Early Learning (2022) Questions and Answers
<https://www.parliament.nsw.gov.au/lc/papers/pages/qanda-tracking-details.aspx?pk=94047>